

Appl. No. 10/681,829  
Amdt. sent March 22, 2006  
Reply to Office Action of November 2, 2005

PATENT

**Amendments to the Drawings:**

The attached sheets of drawings includes changes to Figs. 1A-1C. The sheet, which includes Figs. 1A-1C replaces the original sheet. In addition, sheets containing Figs. 5A, 5B, 7A, and 7B have been replaced with clearer figures.

Attachment: Replacement Sheets

**REMARKS/ARGUMENTS**

Claims 1-45 are pending.

Claims 1-7, 9, 10, and 45 were rejected under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) for allegedly being unpatentable over Gossweiller, III et al., U.S. Patent No. 6,400,372 in view of Kichury, Jr., U.S. Patent No. 5,831,620.

A drawing correction was required to include “PRIOR ART” in Figs. 1A-1C. The figures have been amended accordingly. In addition, Figs. 5 and 7 have been replaced with clearer figures. No new matter has been added.

The undersigned would like to thank the examiner for her time and attention during an interview conducted on March 21, 2006. Although no agreement was reached, a discussion of the references was conducted and potential clarifying claim language was discussed. The claims have been amended accordingly.

Claim 1 as amended recites in part a rendering system that computes a first point of intersection between a ray and a first LOD of an object, and computes a second point of intersection between the ray and a second LOD of the object. The remaining independent claims 7, 19, and 31 have been similarly amended.

Gossweiller was cited for teaching that an object can be associated with multiple LODs. Kichury was cited for Fig. 9. However, Fig. 9 does not show a ray intersecting a first LOD of an object and the same ray intersecting a second LOD of the object. Rather, Fig. 9 shows a ray intersecting a object labeled “object”; the figure does not show a first LOD of the object and a second LOD of the object. Fig. 9 also shows a ray intersecting two mirrors; the figure does not show that the illustrated mirrors represent a first LOD and a second LOD.

The examiner noted that Kichury teaches a ray tracing technique and that Gossweiller teaches selecting LODs, and that it would be obvious to combine the two references because it would create real-time mirror reflections in a computer-generated scene.

Respectfully, however, that rationale (“it would create real-time mirror reflections in a computer-generated scene”) is simply a restatement of Kichury’s Field of the Invention, and does not explain how Gossweiller’s selection of an LOD could be used to modify Kichury to

arrive at the recited computing a first intersection point between a first LOD and a ray and computing a second intersection point between a second LOD and the same ray.

In fact, Gossweiller does not teach selecting multiple LODs of an object, but rather to select a level of detail. In particular, “the level of detail selected for each object in a scene is determined based upon a variable normalized risk parameter which may be supplied by the application.” *Abstract*. Gossweiller describes using a variable risk parameter as a criterion for selecting an LOD from among many LODs for an object. *Col. 3, lines 11-16*. Gossweiller was not concerned with selecting many LODs. In fact, Gossweiller describes selecting an LOD for use in determining when to transition from one LOD to the next LOD. *Col. 3, lines 1-3*. Thus, even if Gossweiller could be combined with Kichuri, the result would only be the selection of one LOD (per Gossweiller) for computing reflections (per Kichuri).

The Section 103 rejection of the claims is therefore believed to be overcome.

In view of the foregoing, Applicants believe all claims now pending in this Application are in condition for allowance. The issuance of a formal Notice of Allowance at an early date is respectfully requested.

If the Examiner believes a telephone conference would expedite prosecution of this application, please telephone the undersigned at 650-326-2400.

Respectfully submitted,



George B. F. Yee  
Reg. No. 37,478

TOWNSEND and TOWNSEND and CREW LLP  
Two Embarcadero Center, Eighth Floor  
San Francisco, California 94111-3834  
Tel: 650-326-2400  
Fax: 415-576-0300  
GBFY:cmm  
60651487 v1